THE AUSTRALIAN LAW JOURNAL

Volume 90, Number 7
July 2016

CURRENT ISSUES – Editor: Justice François Kunc
Two reports on juries ................................................................. 451
Juries in sexual abuse cases ........................................................ 451
The right sentence: What jurors would do ................................... 452
The Chief Justices and “The Australian” ..................................... 452
An Australian international commercial court ............................ 453
Queensland considers cameras in the court ............................... 453
Legal aid does matter ................................................................ 454
Indigenous legal issues: South Australia and the Northern Territory ........................................ 454
Harder and slower to settle? ....................................................... 455

CONVEYANCING AND PROPERTY – Editor: Peter Butt
Effect of consolidation of titles ...................................................... 456
Land under the sea .................................................................. 457
Land by the sea (1): Public right to bathe .................................... 458
Land by the sea (2): Gathering seashells by the seashore ............... 458

OVERSEAS LAW – Editor: Colin Picker
UK Supreme Court reconsiders directors’ duties ........................... 462

ENVIRONMENTAL LAW – Editor: Justice Rachel Pepper
Federal environment policy ........................................................ 465
Significant environmental decisions of the Federal Court ............ 465
New South Wales .................................................................. 467
Northern Territory ................................................................. 468
Queensland .......................................................................... 469
Tasmania .............................................................................. 470
Victoria ................................................................................. 471
Western Australia ................................................................. 472

RECENT CASES – Editor: Ruth C A Higgins
Negligence: Duty of care – Scope of duty of care – Solicitor receiving instructions from testator to prepare will ......................................................... 474
Legal practitioners: Negligence – Advocates’ immunity from suit – Advice given out of court – Agreed settlement of proceedings ......................................................... 475
Contracts: Obligation to manage loans – Tort – Vicarious liability – Employer ......................... 477
ARTICLES

GETTING TO GRIPS WITH ENCROACHMENTS ON FREEDOMS IN COMMONWEALTH LAWS: THE ALRC FREEDOMS INQUIRY

Rosalind Croucher

This article provides a snapshot of the work of the Australian Law Reform Commission in the 18-month inquiry into encroachments by Commonwealth laws on “traditional rights, freedoms and privileges”, that concluded with the tabling of the report, Traditional Rights and Freedoms – Encroachments by Commonwealth Laws, on 2 March 2016. The contextual landscape of the common law is discussed; and the challenge of crafting an appropriate methodology to tackle this wide-ranging inquiry to meet the tasks of the Terms of Reference and provide a forward-looking law reform response is considered. The article concludes with an illustration of the law reform approach in two areas in the list of 19 dot-points of the Terms of Reference: freedom of speech and property rights.

WHY ARE DECISIONS ON FAMILY PROPERTY SO INCONSISTENT?

Patrick Parkinson AM

This article argues that the law on family property in Australia is plagued with uncertainty at its very core and that the Full Court of the Family Court, as the primary appeal court in this jurisdiction, is structurally incapable of providing doctrinal coherence. Decisions of the Full Court, which ought to provide guidance to trial judges, are often inconsistent in their approach to similar fact situations, both in terms of reasoning and outcome, thus making it difficult to settle cases in the shadow of the law except in straightforward matters. Examples of the uncertainty are given concerning how the Court should deal with third party debts, property owned prior to the relationship, inheritances, post-separation windfalls, superannuation entitlements, the treatment of domestic violence in property cases and the significance of a disparity in wealth for the purposes of s 75(2) adjustments. This article then seeks to explain why the law has become so unclear. Reasons include the lack of objects and principles in the legislation, the decision of the High Court in Mallet (1984), the misinterpretation of the 1983 amendments by the Full Court in Shaw (1989), the lack of guidance on how to interpret the s 75(2) factors after Collins (1990), an unconstitutional view of the width of judicial discretion, the rarity of High Court interventions and the lack of an authoritative decision-making process in the Full Court. As a consequence, family property law is for the most part, a practice without a theory. The article concludes with consideration of whether and how the coherence of this area of law can be restored to allow people to bargain in the shadow of a reasonably settled body of law. It is argued that the problems, which have serious consequences for the general public, are unlikely to be resolved without major structural reform to the Full Court, more prescriptive legislation, or both. In the absence of statutory reform, the use of the case-stated mechanism with five-member Benches may help to resolve some inconsistencies.

BOOK REVIEWS – Editor: Angelina A Gomez

Intentional Tort Litigation in Australia: Assault, False Imprisonment, Malicious

Prosecution and Related Claims by Corrie Goodhand and Peter O’Brien

Adjudication on the Gold Fields in New South Wales and Victoria in the 19th Century by John P Hamilton

Veterans’ Entitlements and Military Compensation Law by Robyn Creyke and Peter Sutherland

OBITUARY

Russell Scott AM
HIGH COURT REPORTS – Staff of Thomson Reuters

DECISIONS RECEIVED IN JUNE 2016

Alqudsi v The Queen (High Court and Federal Court) ([2016] HCA 24) .......................... 711
Betts v The Queen (Criminal Law) ([2016] HCA 25) ......................................................... 758
Hall v Hall (Family Law and Child Welfare) ([2016] HCA 23) ........................................ 695
Robinson Helicopter Co Inc v McDermott (Appeal and New Trial; Torts; Trade and Commerce) ([2016] HCA 22) ................................................................. 679