

---

# Australian Law Journal

GENERAL EDITOR  
Justice François Kunc

THOMSON REUTERS EDITOR  
Cheryle King

ASSISTANT GENERAL EDITORS

Nuncio D'Angelo <i>Solicitor, Sydney</i>	Angelina Gomez <i>Lawyer, Perth</i>	Ruth Higgins SC <i>Barrister, Sydney</i>	Clare Langford <i>Solicitor, Sydney</i>
---	--	---	--

The mode of citation of this volume is  
**(2017) 91 ALJ [page]**

The views expressed in editorial comment, articles or notes are those of the author or contributor, and are not to be taken as being the views of, or endorsed by, the journal editors unless otherwise indicated.

*The Australian Law Journal* is a refereed journal.

## Australian Law Journal Reports

PRODUCTION EDITOR  
Carolyn May

CASE REPORTERS  
John Carroll  
Alan Luchetti  
Colleen Tognetti  
Stefan Skopelja

The mode of citation of this volume is:  
**91 ALJR [page]**

---

# THE AUSTRALIAN LAW JOURNAL

Volume 91, Number 12

December 2017

## CURRENT ISSUES – Editor: Justice François Kunc

Recommended National Standards for Working with Interpreters in Courts and Tribunals .....	943
Commonwealth Government Responds to the Referendum Council's Report .....	944
Commonwealth Redress Scheme for Victims of Institutional Child Sexual Abuse .....	945
Aboriginal Languages Act 2017 (NSW) .....	946
30 Years of the Judicial Commission of NSW .....	946
Same-Sex Marriage Law Reform: One Dispute Resolved .....	947
The IBA Comes to Sydney .....	948
New Approach to Statutory Interpretation? .....	948
 LETTERS TO THE EDITOR .....	950

## CONVEYANCING AND PROPERTY – Editors: Robert Angyal SC and Brendan Edgeworth

Parking and Easements: Again .....	952
Airbnb Short-Term Letting in Strata Schemes .....	954

## PERSONALIA – Editor: Clare Langford

### Commonwealth

Justice David Graham Thomas .....	958
-----------------------------------	-----

### New South Wales

Justice Guy Parker .....	958
--------------------------	-----

### Queensland

Justice Helen Bowskill .....	958
President Walter Sofronoff .....	959

## ADMIRALTY AND MARITIME – Editor: Dr Damien J Cremeen

Admiralty Act 1988 (Cth) s 6(b) .....	960
---------------------------------------	-----

## RECENT CASES – Editor: Ruth C A Higgins SC

Constitutional Law: Parliamentary Elections – Where Referred Persons Elected to Commonwealth Parliament – Dual Citizenship – Commonwealth Constitution, s 44(i) .....	963
---	-----

---

Canada: Torts – Negligence – Motor Vehicles – Mental Injury – Damages – Claimant Suing in Negligence as Result of Motor Vehicle Accident – What Constitutes Mental Injury .....	964
Probate: Whether Wrongdoer Can Benefit Indirectly as a Result of Crime – Administration Act 1903 (WA) – Benefit Denied .....	966

## ARTICLES

### PACIOCCO IN THE HIGH COURT: PENALTIES AND LATE PAYMENT FEES

#### **J G H Stumbles**

In upholding the bank's late payment fee in Paciocco, the High Court recognised that in certain cases, the validity of an impugned penalty clause may now be determined by reference to damage to legitimate, commercial or other interests over and above compensable damage ordinarily recoverable in an action for breach of contract. In doing so, the Court followed some of the reasoning of the UK Supreme Court in the recent Cavendish and ParkingEye litigation. This article analyses the Court's judgment, its implications for the penalty doctrine and the ongoing relevance of Lord Dunedin's well known propositions in the Dunlop case. ....

969

### AUSTRALIAN RULES: A SURVEY OF THE HIGH COURT OF AUSTRALIA ON CONSTRUCTION LAW 1965-2016

#### **Professor John Sharkey AM**

Since Federation the High Court has provided the major judicial guidance for Australian construction lawyers notwithstanding that for most of that time the Privy Council remained the ultimate court of appeal. One might reasonably have expected to see an enhancement of the role with the abolition of appeals to the Privy Council. However, the subsequent period has seen a continuing decline in the instances of the High Court identifying an issue of principle in construction law that warranted the granting of special leave. Moreover, where the Court has granted special leave it has largely been in cases involving non-contractual relationships. In analysing the contribution of the High Court to Australian construction law over the last half century in both substantive and quantitative terms this article examines why the decline occurred and submits a view as to what the 21st century might hold for the High Court and this field of the law. ....

986

## Australian Law Journal Reports

### HIGH COURT REPORTS – Staff of Thomson Reuters

#### DECISIONS RECEIVED IN OCTOBER/NOVEMBER 2017

Barrow, Re ( <i>Citizenship and Migration; High Court and Federal Court</i> ) ([2017] HCA 47) .....	1240
BRF038 v Republic of Nauru ( <i>Citizenship and Migration; High Court and Federal Court</i> ) ([2017] HCA 44) .....	1197

---

Brown v Tasmania ( <i>Constitutional Law; Energy and Resources</i> ) ([2017] HCA 43) .....	1089
Canavan, Re ( <i>Constitutional Law</i> ) ([2017] HCA 45) .....	1209
Cecil v Director of Public Prosecutions (Nauru) ( <i>Criminal Law; High Court and Federal Court</i> ) ([2017] HCA 46) .....	1236
Kepae v Director of Public Prosecutions (Nauru) ( <i>Criminal Law; High Court and Federal Court</i> ) ([2017] HCA 46) .....	1236
Koani v The Queen ( <i>Criminal Law</i> ) ([2017] HCA 42) .....	1079
Jeremiah v Director of Public Prosecutions (Nauru) ( <i>Criminal Law; High Court and Federal Court</i> ) ([2017] HCA 46) .....	1236
Joyce, Re ( <i>Constitutional Law</i> ) ([2017] HCA 45) .....	1209
Ludlam, Re ( <i>Constitutional Law</i> ) ([2017] HCA 45) .....	1209
Nash, Re ( <i>Constitutional Law</i> ) ([2017] HCA 45) .....	1209
Roberts (No 2), Re ( <i>Constitutional Law</i> ) ([2017] HCA 45) .....	1209
Thorne v Kennedy ( <i>Equity; Family Law and Child Welfare</i> ) ([2017] HCA 49) .....	1260
Van Beelen v The Queen ( <i>Criminal Law; High Court and Federal Court</i> ) ([2017] HCA 48) .....	1244
Waters, Re ( <i>Constitutional Law</i> ) ([2017] HCA 45) .....	1209
Xenophon, Re ( <i>Constitutional Law</i> ) ([2017] HCA 45) .....	1209